

THE BODY THEORY

Ted Sider, Metaphysics

Basic idea: $P1 = P2$ iff $P1$ and $P2$ have the same body.

1. THE ARISTOTELIAN THEORY

Substances: particular things (e.g., people, tables, chairs, etc.)

Properties: features (universals) had by substances

Essential property of x : a property that x must have in order for x itself to exist

Accidental property of x : a non-essential property of x

Form of a substance: its essential properties.

Matter of a substance: the stuff that's in the substance's form.

What makes a substance the same substance as an earlier substance is that its matter is the same, or obtained from the matter of the former substance by gradual replacement, while continuing to possess the essential properties which constitute its form. (Swinburne, pp. 318-319)

2. THE BODY THEORY

If we apply Aristotle's general account of the identity of substances to persons, it follows that for a person to be the same person as an earlier person, he has to have the same matter (or matter obtained from that earlier person by gradual replacement) organized into the form of a person. The essential properties which make the form of a person would include, for Aristotle, not merely shape and physiological properties, but a kind of way of behaving and a capacity for a mental life of thought and feeling. (Swinburne, p. 319)

$P1$ is *body-continuous* with a later person $P2$ iff: $P2$ has the same matter or matter obtained from $P1$'s matter by gradual replacement, organized throughout into the form of a person (i.e., into a thing with certain psychological as well as physical features)

Body theory: $P1$ is identical with a later $P2$ iff $P1$ is bodily continuous with $P2$

3. THE BRAIN-SWAP OBJECTION

Suppose my brain is cut out and placed in Madonna's body; and suppose her brain is cut out and placed in my body. Call the person with Madonna's body but my brain afterwards, "Tedonna"

- (i) I beforehand am not bodily continuous with Tedonna
- (ii) If (i) and the body theory are true, then I am not = to Tedonna
- (iii) I am = to Tedonna
- (iv) Therefore, the body theory is false

4. THE BRAIN THEORY

P1 is *brain-continuous* with P2 iff P2's brain has the same matter or matter obtained from the matter of P1's brain by gradual replacement, organized throughout into the form of a brain

The Brain theory: Person P1 = a later person Person P2 iff P1 is brain-continuous with P2